Response to Clearing permit advertisement:

Document reference	Concern	Response Lot 6	Response Lot 8
Submission 1, p1, para 2	Impact on TEC and PEC	Reference: Commonwealth of Australia (2019). Approved Conservation Advice (incorporating listing advice) for Tuart (Eucalyptus gomphocephala) woodlands and forests of the Swan Coastal Plain Ecological Community	The proposal will not impact any TEC or PEC within Lot 8.
		Keighery BJ (1994). Bushland Plant Survey: A guide to plant community survey for the community. Wildflower Society of Western Australia (Inc.), Nedlands	
		Patane Farms Pty Ltd acknowledges the proposed direct impact to 3.25 ha of Tuart Woodlands and Forests of the Swan Coastal Plain ecological community (92 Tuart paddock trees), based on canopy area, which is in a completely degraded condition (Keighery 1994). Approximately 0.05 ha of this area of TEC also has affinities with the Southern <i>Eucalyptus gomphocephala - Agonis flexuosa</i> woodlands PEC.	
		Approximately 0.55 ha of the TEC/PEC will be retained in Lot 6 outside of the clearing envelope.	
		Patane Farms Pty Ltd is committed to working with DAWE and DWER through the assessment process to provide suitable direct offsets to offset the loss of TEC/PEC.	
		Direct offsets will likely include applying a conservation covenant over and enhancing (fencing, weed control and	

		 infill planting) suitably sized and significantly larger patches of the Tuart TEC. These patches are in a better condition to the Tuart TEC proposed to be cleared and located immediately adjacent to or with two kilometres of the area under application. Offsets will be provided in line with the EPBC Act environmental offsets policy (2012) and Offsets assessment guide, as well as the WA Environmental Offsets Policy (2011), and WA Environmental Offsets Guidelines (2014) to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER. 	
Submission 1, p1, para 2 Submission 3, Section 1B	Impact to threatened fauna	Reference: SW Environmental (2020) Level 1 and Targeted Fauna Survey Lots 6 and Lot 8 Old Coast Road, Myalup Patane Farms Pty Ltd is committed to working with DAWE and DWER through the assessment process to provide suitable direct offsets to offset the loss of threatened fauna habitat. Direct offsets will likely include applying a conservation covenant over and enhancing (fencing, weed control and infill planting) suitably sized and significantly larger patches of the Tuart TEC. These patches are likely to provide potential black cockatoo breeding and WRP habitat (to be confirmed through technical studies). If required, the habitat value will be enhanced through the installation of a suitable number of artificial hollows.	The installation of a suitable number of possum boxes will be considered within the areas of vegetation being retained within Lot 8. The proposed revegetation and buffer areas (2.4 ha total, 1.3 ha in Lot 8) will include tree species known to be used by black cockatoo for foraging. A Revegetation Plan will be prepared to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER to identify the location, species and densities of plantings.
		The revegetation and buffer areas (2.4 ha total, 1.1 ha in Lot 6) will include tree species known to be used by black cockatoo for foraging. A Revegetation Plan will be prepared	

		to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER to identify the location, species and densities of plantings. The area under application in Lot 6 does not provide WRP habitat. Offsets will be provided in line with the EPBC Act environmental offsets policy (2012) and Offsets assessment guide, as well as the WA Environmental Offsets Policy (2011), and WA Environmental Offsets Guidelines (2014) to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER.	
Submission 2, p4 para 3	Fauna and flora of significance in Lot 8	Comment not relevant to Lot 6.	Reference:Keighery BJ (1994). Bushland Plant Survey: A guide to plantcommunity survey for the community. Wildflower Societyof Western Australia (Inc.), NedlandsSW Environmental (2020) Level 1 and Targeted FaunaSurvey Lots 6 and Lot 8 Old Coast Road, MyalupPatane Produce notes that although the vegetation in Lot 8is in a completely degraded condition (Keighery 1994) andthere are no trees with hollows likely to be currentlysuitable for black cockatoo breeding, vegetation within thelot does have environmental value:• Feed residue was observed within the study areawithin Lot 8, in low abundances from Carnaby's
			 cockatoo. Marri and Jarrah are plant species foraging known to be utilised by Carnaby's cockatoos. The single WRP observed is likely to be using the eastern edge of Lot 8 as part of a larger connected patch off site to the west. This patch will be

			retained. The remainder of the Lot 8 clearing footprint is considered marginal in terms of WRP habitat quality due to the lack of connected canopy or midstorey. The clearing area is not located along a strategic corridor and is considered unlikely to provide significant habitat to any local populations of WRP. Proposed impacts to WRP are therefore considered to be low and not significant. The installation of a suitable number of possum boxes will be considered within the areas of vegetation being retained within Lot 8. The proposed revegetation and buffer areas (1.1 ha in Lot 8) will include tree species known to be used by black cockatoo for foraging. The revegetation corridor will also improve connectivity (through the canopy and midstory) for WRP across the site in the longer term once established. A Revegetation Plan will be prepared to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER to identify the location, species and densities of plantings.
Submission 3, Section 1A	Clearing of TEC	Reference: Commonwealth of Australia (2019). Approved Conservation Advice (incorporating listing advice) for Tuart (Eucalyptus gomphocephala) woodlands and forests of the Swan Coastal Plain Ecological Community	Comment not relevant to Lot 8.
		Keighery BJ (1994). Bushland Plant Survey: A guide to plant community survey for the community. Wildflower Society of Western Australia (Inc.), Nedlands	

Stream Environment and Water (2020) Desktop and
structural vegetation survey of Lot 6 and Lot 8 Old Coast
Road Myalup. Unpublished report to SW Environmental.
The Stream Environment and Water (2020) report identified
the Tuart TEC eligibility of paddock trees based on the patch
definition as outlined in Commonwealth of Australia (2019)
as 'the presence of at least two living <i>Eucalyptus</i>
gomphocephala trees in the uppermost canopy layer with a
gap of no more than 60m between the outer edges of the
Tuart trees'.
As the vegetation in Lot 6 is in a completely degraded
condition (Keighery 1994) and exists as paddock trees, the
canopy area of the TEC vegetation under application is
actually 3.25 ha.
Approximately 0.55 ha of the TEC/PEC will be retained in Lot
6 outside of the clearing envelope.
Patane Farms Pty Ltd is committed to working with DAWE
and DWER through the assessment process to provide
suitable direct offsets to offset the loss of TEC/PEC.
Direct offsets will likely include applying a conservation
covenant over and enhancing (fencing, weed control and
infill planting) suitably sized and significantly larger patches
of the Tuart TEC. These patches are in a better condition to
the Tuart TEC proposed to be cleared and located
immediately adjacent to or with two kilometres of the area
under application.

		Offsets will be provided in line with the EPBC Act environmental offsets policy (2012) and Offsets assessment guide, as well as the WA Environmental Offsets Policy (2011), and WA Environmental Offsets Guidelines (2014) to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER.	
Submission 3, Section 1B	TEC vegetation condition	Reference:Keighery BJ (1994). Bushland Plant Survey: A guide to plantcommunity survey for the community. Wildflower Societyof Western Australia (Inc.), NedlandsStream Environment and Water (2020) Desktop andstructural vegetation survey of Lot 6 and Lot 8 Old CoastRoad Myalup. Unpublished report to SW Environmental.The Stream Environment and Water report (2020) assessedthe vegetation against the Keighery (1994) condition scale.Patane Farms Pty Ltd does not dispute the Tuart TEC statusof the vegetation in Lot 6, nor the high conservation valueor intrinsic value of Tuart paddock trees along the SwanCoastal Plain.The vegetation condition scale has not been suggested bythe proponent to be a proxy for vegetation value. It is notedhowever that the direct offsets to be formally proposed willinclude significantly larger patches of the Tuart TEC that are	Comment not relevant to Lot 8.
Submission 3, Section 1D	Value of Peppermint	in a better condition to the Tuart TEC proposed to be cleared (Keighery 1994). Comment not relevant to Lot 6.	Reference:

trees in Lot	Keighery BJ (1994). Bushland Plant Survey: A guide to plant
8	community survey for the community. Wildflower Society
	of Western Australia (Inc.), Nedlands
	Stream Environment and Water (2020) Desktop and
	structural vegetation survey of Lot 6 and Lot 8 Old Coast
	Road Myalup. Unpublished report to SW Environmental.
	The vegetation condition scale has not been suggested by
	the proponent to be a proxy for vegetation value. Further
	the value of Peppermint trees and other midstorey species
	to WRP is not disputed.
	However, the single record of WRP in Lot 8, the lack of
	records or evidence of WRP across the eastern part of Lot 8,
	and the patchy nature of the Peppermint trees over the site
	(most trees have an isolated canopy in the application area),
	indicates that the vegetation under application is currently
	unlikely to provide significant habitat to any local
	populations of WRP (SW Environmental 2020).
	The installation of possum boxes will be considered within
	the areas of vegetation being retained within Lot 8.
	The proposed revegetation and buffer areas (1.1 ha in Lot 8)
	will include a mixture of shrub and tree species with
	connected canopies. The revegetation corridor will also
	improve connectivity (through the canopy and midstorey)
	for WRP across the site in the longer term once established.
	A Revegetation Plan will be prepared to the satisfaction of
	DAWE and DWER to identify the location, species and
	densities of plantings.

Submission 3, Conclusions	Long term climate change	The Tuart vegetation in Lot 6 exists as paddock trees has been historically grazed. Given this continued landuse there is no opportunity for long term succession or regeneration of Tuart trees within Lot 6. Patane Produce is committed to working with DAWE and DWER through the assessment process to provide suitable direct offsets to offst the loss of TEC/PEC.	Comment not relevant to Lot 8.
		Direct offsets will likely include applying a conservation covenant over and enhancing (fencing, weed control and infill planting) suitably sized and significantly larger patches of the Tuart TEC These patches are in a better condition to the Tuart TEC proposed to be cleared and located immediately adjacent to or with two kilometres of the area under application.	
		Offsets will be provided in line with the EPBC Act environmental offsets policy (2012) and Offsets assessment guide, as well as the WA Environmental Offsets Policy (2011), and WA Environmental Offsets Guidelines (2014) to the satisfaction of DAWE and DWER.	
Sub2,p2,para2	Chemical spray drift	Reference:Standard Spray Drift Risk Assessment Scenarios –Australian Pesticides & Veterinary Medicines AuthorityOperating Principles in Relation to Spray DriftManagement Commonwealth of Australia.Table A assessment. Low Boom Spray utilised with Mediumto Course droplets results in minimum separation distanceof 15m Open Field & 10m with Buffer elements.	Reference:Standard Spray Drift Risk Assessment Scenarios –Australian Pesticides & Veterinary Medicines AuthorityOperating Principles in Relation to Spray DriftManagement Commonwealth of Australia.Table A assessment. Low Boom Spray utilised with Mediumto Course droplets results in minimum separation distanceof 15m Open Field & 10m with Buffer elements.

Sub	Noise	Reference:	Reference:
2,p2,para3		Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997, Part 2 Division 2 r.12.	<i>Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997, Part 2 Division 2 r.12.</i>
		Farming vehicles are exempt from noise regulation 7. Irrigation equipment is not exempt but we will be installing electric pump systems which will be located more than 300m from Sensitive use Boundary & 400m from Sensitive use building and will therefore not generate any additional noise. Refer to Operations Management Plan (see appendix 1).	Farming vehicles are exempt from noise regulation 7. Irrigation equipment is not exempt but we will be installing electric pump systems which will be located 150m from Sensitive use boundary & 225m from Sensitive use building and will therefore not generate any additional noise. Refer to Operations Management Plan (see appendix 1).
Sub	Dust	Reference:	Reference:
2,p2,para3		Environmental Factor Guideline for Air.	Environmental Factor Guideline for Air.
		Dust maybe caused by bare -soil areas.	Dust maybe caused by bare -soil areas.
		Refer to Patane's Operations Management Plan (see appendix 1)	Refer to Patane's Operations Management Plan (see appendix 1).
Sub	Odours	Reference:	Reference:
2,p2,para3		Odour Guideline (der.wa.gov.au).	Odour Guideline (der.wa.gov.au).
		Areas of concern are the storage and application of organic	Areas of concern are the storage and application of organic
		fertilisers (such as manure). Patane Produce does not use organic fertilisers.	fertilisers (such as manure). Patane Produce does not use organic fertilisers.
		Another area of concern is the odour from the application	Another area of concern is the odour from the application
		of chemicals.	of chemicals.
Sub 2,p4 p1	Financial	Reference:	Reference:
Sub 2, p4, p6	impact	Shire of Harvey: Health, Building & Town Planning	Shire of Harvey: Health, Building & Town Planning
		Committee minutes 04 March,2003. The approval by the	Committee minutes 04 March,2003
		Shire of Harvey of a residential development within an	The approval by the Shire of Harvey of a 'Short Stay Chalet
		Agricultural precinct has already negatively impacted on the	Park, Stables and Horse Agistment' development within an
		value of the existing General Farming & Horticulture	Agricultural precinct has already negatively impacted on the
		properties. Two of the three neighbouring properties of Lot	value of the existing General Farming & Horticulture
		6 were already horticulture when the development was	properties. The several of the nearby properties of Lot 6

		approved. Within a farming area there is no reason that vegetable farming is any less attractive, or will have any additional impact on land values, than any other farming businesses.	were already horticulture when the development was approved. Within a farming area there is no reason that vegetable farming is any less attractive, or will have any additional impact on land values, than any other farming businesses.
Sub 2, p4,p5	Terminal illnesses	Reference:Standard Spray Drift Risk Assessment Scenarios –Australian Pesticides & Veterinary Medicines AuthorityOperating Principles in Relation to Spray DriftManagement Commonwealth of Australia.All chemical applications used on Patane's farms are appliedin line with best practice, the APVMA requirements (legalrequirements), and the Enviroveg program.	Reference: Standard Spray Drift Risk Assessment Scenarios – Australian Pesticides & Veterinary Medicines Authority Operating Principles in Relation to Spray Drift Management Commonwealth of Australia. All chemical applications used on Patane's farms are applied in line with best practice, the APVMA requirements (legal requirements), and the Enviroveg program.
Sub 2,p3 Sub 3, p4,para1-3	Land use conflict & Separation distance	Reference: Shire of Harvey: Health, Building & Town Planning Committee minutes 04 March,2003. The minutes relating to the approval of the Permanent Residential Development known as Remlap Ranch (Lot100) included at point 3 on the agenda 'Adjoining neighbours land usage & potential conflicts'. It is therefore assumed that the adjoining property (Lot4424)'s – and the majority of properties in the vicinity - existing Horticulture was considered and deemed acceptable and/or the building envelope was determined to create an acceptable buffer to any farming activities carried out on adjacent properties. The existing separation distance between residential abodes and boundary fence of Lot 6 is 100m, Consisting of 10m Bridle Path & additional 90m from boundary fence to nearest residential building.	Reference: Shire of Harvey: Health, Building & Town Planning Committee minutes 04 March,2003. The minutes relating to the approval of Lots 100 for Permanent Residential & Lot 101 as "Restricted Use" for purposes of Short Stay Chalet Park development known as Remlap Ranch included at point 3 on the agenda 'Adjoining neighbours land usage & potential conflicts'. It is therefore assumed that the adjoining property (Lot4424)'s- and the majority of properties in the vicinity's - existing Horticulture was considered and deemed acceptable and/or the building envelope was determined to create an acceptable buffer to any farming activities carried out on adjacent properties. The existing separation distance between Lot 8's northern fenceline and Lot 5 of & 6 of Strata 43660 (being the nearest residential property) is currently 50m, Consisting of 30m

	Patane is proposing to add an additional measure to complement the existing separation distance and address the current requirements of 'Guidelines for separation of agricultural and residential land uses, 'consisting of the following buffer: Layer 1, 10m of planted native trees & shrubs* suitable for offering a buffer to the height of 1.6m. Layer 2, An artificial barrier of shade-cloth with 50% porosity to a height of 1.8m secured between posts at 6m intervals. Height of 1.8m exceeding the requirement of the Health Dept to have a barrier two times the height of spray release. Spray release height is approx. 750mm. Layer 3, Another 10m of planted natives trees & shrubs* suitable for offering a buffer to the height of 1.6m. The layering of vegetation on either side of the artificial barrier will soften the visual aspect and also increase the performance (Reference; Natural and Artificial Barriers for Spray Drift Exposure Mitigation in South Australia 20100406 Spray Buffer Report 2009 second version .pdf (pir.sa.gov.au)) The maintenance of these barriers is to be the responsibility of Patane Farms Pty Ltd. *Species of trees and shrubs to be determined once clearing permit approval has been obtained from DWER. Anticipate that there will be a 65% shrubs 35% trees. Patane also has an 'Operations Management Plan' (see appendix 1) which will further mitigate any issues that are deemed to be associated with separation of land uses.	Road and associated road verge & an additional 20m from boundary fence to nearest residential building. Patane is proposing to add an additional measure to complement the existing separation distance and address the current requirements of 'Guidelines for separation of agricultural and residential land uses, 'consisting of the following buffer: Layer 1, 10m of planted native trees & shrubs* suitable for offering a buffer to the height of 1.6m. Layer 2, An artificial barrier of shade-cloth with 50% porosity to a height of 1.8m secured between posts at 6m intervals. Height of 1.8m exceeding the requirement of the Health Dept to have a barrier two times the height of spray release. Spray release height is approx. 750mm. Layer 3, Another 10m of planted natives trees & shrubs* suitable for offering a buffer to the height of 1.6m. The layering of vegetation on either side of the artificial barrier will soften the visual aspect and also increase the performance (Reference; Natural and Artificial Barriers for Spray Drift Exposure Mitigation in South Australia 20100406 Spray Buffer Report 2009 second version .pdf (pir.sa.gov.au)) The maintenance of these barriers is to be the responsibility of Patane Farms Pty Ltd. *Species of trees and shrubs to be determined once clearing permit approval has been obtained from DWER. Anticipate that there will be a 65% shrubs 35% trees. Patane also has an 'Operations Management Plan' (see appendix 1) which will further mitigate any issues that are deemed to be associated with separation of land uses.
Sub 3, p5	I have referred to DPIRD for comment & am also trying to	Patane Produce operates 13 properties in the Myalup
	find some information regarding damage caused by hort as	Horticultural Precinct and many of these have wetlands.

		 opposed to damage caused by residents of the 73 proposed houses in the estates (currently on about 16 have been built) Patane Produce operates 13 properties in the Myalup Horticultural Precinct and many of these have wetlands. We therefore have many years of experience in conducting our operations in a manner which does not impact on these features. All operations are conducted by trained employees and done so according to: Ausveg 'Enviroveg' & vegetablesWA 'Good Practice Guide'. The groundwater gradient and the surface are not correlated at this scale. The groundwater flows west and the ridge and the soils pereability are not causal. 	We therefore have many years of experience in conducting our operations in a manner which does not impact on these features. All operations are conducted by trained employees and done so according to: Ausveg 'Enviroveg' & vegetablesWA 'Good Practice Guide' The groundwater gradient and the surface are not correlated at this scale. The groundwater flows west and the ridge and the soils pereability are not causal. The bloom (High TN) photographed in 2018 was most probably caused by cattle grazing.
Submission 3, page 6, paragraph 2	Bushfire hazard	Bushfires are a risk associated with living in rural farming areas. This issue would have been considered by both the agency approving the sub division of the Remlap Estate and the prospective purchasers, particularly due to the adjacent State Forest and well established pine plantation. Lot 6 has an existing fire break road surrounding the estate properties to ensure that there is vehicular access to the rear of all properties. This, coupled with the clear access and irrigation from the western side of the boundary will ensure that should there be any spot fires from the buffer they can be easily accessed and extinguished. The threat from a fire front of the size expressed in the submission coming from the East via a pine plantation would be significantly more problematic than the proposed buffer.	Bushfires are a risk associated with living in rural farming areas. This issue would have been considered by both the agency approving the sub division of the Remlap Estate and the prospective purchasers, particularly due to the adjacent State Forest and well established pine plantation. It is noted that the 5 larger blocks on the Eastern Boundary of the estate have not yet been developed, as per the Development Plan that was approved in 2003, and the estate has allowed a significant high fuel area to amass due to neglect. The Estate has further hindered fire fighting efforts by blocking the eastern access to the estate from West Break Road. We have also been advised that they will be gating the western access. Both signify that fire fighting is not high on the agenda.

Members of the Patane family and their employees are trained and have experience in fighting fires, including bushfires. Patane Produce has significant resources to fight fires within the business. On numerous occasions, members of the Patane family have been called out to, assisted and put out fires located on properties within the Remlap estate that have been inadvertently started by the residents. Patane Produce played a significant part in fighting the Yarloop fires, providing bull dozing equipment, fire fighting vehicles and trained employees 24hrs a day for several days. The clearing, irrigation and cropping of vegetables will provide a significant fire break for the whole community. It will provide fire breaks and fire-fighting capacity that the estate is currently lacking.	The implementation of permanent farming will reduce the fire risk considerably, as the area to the south of the estate will now be maintained to a higher standard and continuous irrigation and land preparation will reduce weed and grass build up, reducing the fuel for grass fire. Members of the Patane family and their employees are trained and have experience in fighting fires, including bushfires. Patane Produce has significant resources to fight fires within the business. On numerous occasions, members of the Patane family have been called out to, assisted and put out fires located on properties within the Remlap estate that have been inadvertently started by the residents. Patane Produce played a significant part in fighting the Yarloop fires, providing bull dozing equipment, fire fighting vehicles and trained employees 24hrs a day for several days. The vegetative buffer will be accessible on all sides which will mitigate any potential risks associated with the planting of the buffer. The area to the south will be permanent irrigation, the area to the north is a road and cleared fire break. The buffer is only 20m wide thereby creating minimal footprint. The Pine Plantation and State Forest to the East is a significant threat to the residents of the estate. The fire risk associated with the vegetative buffer is by no means comparable.
	The clearing, irrigation and cropping of vegetables will provide a significant fire break for the whole community. It will provide fire breaks and fire-fighting capacity that the

			estate is currently lacking. This is particularly important given that there are no permanent residents in the property known as Freshwater Lakes (General Farming with Restricted Use, R16 Short stay accommodation to a maximum of 90days per annum cumulative).
Submission 3, page 7, paragraph 1	Patane Character	xxxxx and xxxxx Patane have liaised with the representatives from both estates on 3 occasions that we have on record. This includes their requirement for us to no longer utilise what we thought was the eastern end of Rigg Road but after investigations it has now been confirmed that this is part of the Freshwater Lakes. There was little information provided and it was resolved by us investigating the strata and other relevant documents. We discontinued utilising the road once the investigations were completed. The other matter which we were contacted about (original email went to junk) was a request to relocate our entry gate. This matter required us to a procure the services of a fencing contractor – which takes time. Once on site, and with reference to the surveyor, it was discovered that the gate did not need relocating and that the Strata body had interpreted the survey report incorrectly. Patane Produce operates 13 properties in the Myalup area. We have experience in Buffer establishment and maintenance. Our buffers are established, maintained and effective.	